SUPPORTING STUDENTS’ PRODUCTIVE STRUGGLE
EFFECTIVE MATHEMATICS TEACHING PRACTICES

1. Establish mathematics goals to focus learning.
2. Implement tasks that promote reasoning and problem solving.
3. Use and connect mathematical representations.
4. Facilitate meaningful mathematical discourse.
5. Pose purposeful questions.
6. Build procedural fluency from conceptual understanding.
7. Support productive struggle in learning mathematics.
8. Elicit and use evidence of student thinking.
EFFECTIVE MATHEMATICS TEACHING PRACTICES

1. Establish mathematics goals to focus learning.
2. Implement tasks that promote reasoning and problem solving.
3. Use and connect mathematical representations.
4. Facilitate meaningful mathematical discourse.
5. Pose purposeful questions.
6. Build procedural fluency from conceptual understanding.
7. **Support productive struggle in learning mathematics.**
8. Elicit and use evidence of student thinking.
CONSIDER SOMETHING THAT YOU LEARNED TO DO, BUT WEREN’T VERY GOOD AT INITIALLY....

- The video I showed here can be found at

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=7EZlEtZagCc

The first 34 seconds only.
TAKE THE CHILD DIVING INTO THE POOL...

How did he get better?
IT WASN’T FROM LISTENING TO A LECTURE....
OR SITTING ON THE SIDELINES....
OR WATCHING AN EXPERT DIVER....
HOW DOES THE CHILD DIVING INTO THE POOL GET BETTER?

He will get better from opportunities to work hard while getting guidance from an experienced other.

By engaging in productive struggle......
SO WHAT IS PRODUCTIVE STRUGGLE AND HOW CAN WE SUPPORT IT?
WHAT IS PRODUCTIVE STRUGGLE?

From Merriam-Webster:

**Productive** -- adjective pro·duc·tive \prə-'dək-tiv, prō-\ doing or achieving a lot; working hard and getting good results

**Struggle** - intransitive verb strug·gle \'strə-gəl\ to try very hard to do, achieve, or deal with something that is difficult or that causes problems

Productive Struggle – working hard at something that is difficult to do, persevering when the going gets tough, and making progress.
Productive struggle should:

- Be considered essential to learning mathematics with understanding;
- Develop students’ capacity to persevere in the face of challenge; and
- Help students realize that they are capable of doing well in mathematics with effort.
“...students expend effort to make sense of mathematics, to figure something out that is not immediately apparent...The struggle we have in mind comes from solving problems that are within reach and grappling with key mathematical ideas that are comprehensible but not yet well formed (Hiebert et al., 1996).”

“…productive struggle comprises the work that students do to make sense of a situation and determine a course of action when a solution strategy is not stated, implied, or immediately obvious. From an equity perspective, this implies that each and every student must have the opportunity to struggle with challenging mathematics and to receive support that encourages their persistence without removing the challenge.”

The struggle is productive if:

- The intended goals and the cognitive demand of the task are maintained;
- Students’ thinking is supported by acknowledging effort and mathematical understanding; and
- Students are able to move forward in the task execution through student actions.

ACTIVITY 1

WHAT IS THE TEACHER DOING TO SUPPORT STUDENTS PRODUCTIVE STRUGGLE?
THE LIFEGUARD TASK

Benjamin’s friend, Maleeka, is taking a job as a lifeguard at the city pool. She will be paid a constant rate per hour. The graph below represents Maleeka’s potential earnings for three different numbers of hours of summer work.

1. Maleeka’s short-term goal is to earn more than $80 for new Xbox One™ games. Describe the number of hours that she must work in order to make enough money for the games. Show all work and represent your answer using words, inequality notation, and a number line.

2. Maleeka’s long-term summer goal is to make more than $750. Determine the number of hours that she must work in order to meet this goal. Show all work and represent your answer using words, inequality notation, and a number line.

Adapted from Seventh Grade Set of Related Lessons:
WAYS TO SOLVE THE LIFEGUARD TASK

• Conclude that the Maleeka makes $12 per hour -- the relationship between the hours worked and the money earned – then divide $80 by 12 and get 6 2/3. So she needs to work more than 6 hours and 40 minutes.

• Draw a line connecting the three points on the graph; Draw a horizontal line through $80 dollars; then draw a vertical line from the point of intersection to the x-axis. This will be the number of hours she needs to work to make $80. So it is anything greater than this.

• Make a table with the given points and fill in the missing points by seeing the pattern – the money earned is 12 x the hours worked. Then determining the she works between 6 and 7.
POSSIBLE CHALLENGES

• Recognizing that the rate per hour is $12.
• Solving an equation rather than an inequality
• Making a table but not being sure how to find the missing values
• Narrowing it down to between 6 and 7 hours and not sure how to get more precise
• Not sure what to do
LIFEGUARD MINI-DIALOGUES

Read the mini-dialogues then:

• Discuss the nature of each students’ struggle.

• Identify what the teacher does to help students move beyond the impasse they had reached.

• Determine whether or not the teacher supported students’ productive struggle.
DISCUSSION OF MINI-CASES OF PRODUCTIVE STRUGGLE

• In which of the mini-dialogues do you think the student was supported in productive struggle? Why?

• What was it about the interaction between the teacher and the student that supported (or did not support) productive struggle?
A student lists the ordered pairs shown below.
(2, 24) (4, 48) (9, 108)

Teacher: Where did these numbers come from?
Student: These are the labels for the points on the graph.
Teacher: So how do they help you answer the question?
Student: Maleeka wants to make $80, and I know that's between four hours and nine hours, but I am not sure how to get closer than that.

Teacher: How much money did Maleeka make in two hours?
Student: $24.
Teacher: So, how much money would she make in one hour? [Student divides 24 by 2 on her paper.]
Student: $12?
Teacher: That's right. So now you know that she makes $12 in one hour, and we want to find out how many hours she needs to work to make more than $80. Do you remember how we used equations to solve problems like this?
Student: 80 ÷ 12?
Teacher: Yes! Solve 12x = $80 by dividing 80 by 12 see what you get.
A student made the table shown below.

Teacher: Tell me what you have here.
Student: I drew a line connected the three points that were given. Then I drew a horizontal line through $80 because that is the least amount of money she wants to make.
Teacher: So what did this tell you?
Student: The point where the two lines intersect is the number of hours where she makes $80. So it is $(x, 80)$. The value of $x$ is somewhere between 6 and 7 hours, but closer to 7.
Teacher: So how can you figure it out more precisely?
Student: I am not sure.
Teacher: If you look at the three points that are given, how are hours worked related to the amount earned?
Student: The hours worked times 12 gives you the amount she earned.
Teacher: So can this help you figure out how to find the x-coordinate of your point of intersection?
Student: I can set up an equation $x (12) = 80$ and solve for $x$.
Teacher: That sounds like a good plan. I will check back in with you later.
A student makes the table shown below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hours</th>
<th>Earnings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Teacher: Tell me how you got the numbers in your table?
Student: I read the points in the graph.
Teacher: Does that help you answer the question?
Student: Not really. She had to work more than four hours but less than eight. I am not sure where to go from here.
Teacher: I am wondering if you could expand your table to include other values that were not on the graph. How could you get started?
Student: I could put in hours 1 through 9 and then see if I could figure out how much she would make for that number.
Teacher: Okay. So how will you figure out how much she earns for any number of hours?
Student: Well, if I look at the three values in the table, it seems that each of the hours was multiplied by 12 to get the earnings. So that means she must make $12 an hour. So, I will just multiply all the hours in my new table by 12 and see if I can find what number of hours get her more than $80.
Teacher: Sounds good!
A student cannot get started.

Teacher: What have you figured out so far?
Student: Nothing. I am not sure what to do.
Teacher: The first thing you need to do is to figure out how much money she makes every hour. Do you remember what operation you need to use to do that?
Student: Divide?
Teacher: What are you going to divide?
Student: 2 ÷ 24?
Teacher: No, 24 ÷ 2.
Student: So, it’s 12.
Teacher: So this is the amount she makes per hour. Now you need to divide 80 by 12.
A student can’t get started.

Teacher: What have you figured out so far?
Student: Nothing. I am not sure what to do.
Teacher: Why don’t you start by reading the problem again and then looking really closely at the graph. I will be back in a few minutes.
# FIVE TYPES OF TEACHER RESPONSES TO STRUGGLE

1. **Telling**
   - Telling involves supplying students with information (e.g., a strategy to use) that removes the struggle, thereby allowing them to make progress on the task by following the prescribed strategy.

2. **Directed Guidance**
   - Directed guidance involves redirecting students to a different strategy, one that is consistent with the teacher’s way of thinking rather than the student’s way of thinking, thereby enabling the student to move beyond the impasse.

3. **Probing Guidance**
   - Probing guidance involves determining what a student is currently thinking, encouraging a student’s self-reflection, and offering ideas that are based on the student’s thinking.

4. **Affordance**
   - Affordance involves asking students to articulate what they have done, encouraging their continued efforts with limited intervention, and allowing them time to continue their work.

5. **Unfocused or Vague**
   - Unfocused or vague responses do not direct students to a particular strategy or build on students’ thinking but instead provides a suggestion that is often too general to be helpful.

---

A student lists the ordered pairs shown below. 
(2, 24)  (4, 48)  (9, 108)

Teacher: Where did these numbers come from?
Student: These are the labels for the points on the graph.
Teacher: So how do they help you answer the question?
Student: Maleeka wants to make $80, and I know that's between four hours and nine hours, but I am not sure how to get closer than that.

Teacher: How much money did Maleeka make in two hours?
Student: $24.
Teacher: So, how much money would she make in one hour? [Student divides 24 by 2 on her paper.]
Student: $12?
Teacher: That's right. So now you know that she makes $12 in one hour, and we want to find out how many hours she needs to work to make more than $80. Do you remember how we used equations to solve problems like this?
Student: 80 ÷ 12?
Teacher: Yes! Solve 12x = $80 by dividing 80 by 12 see what you get.
A student made the table shown below.

Teacher: Tell me what you have here.
Student: I drew a line connected the three points that were given. Then I drew a horizontal line through $80$ because that is the least amount of money she wants to make.
Teacher: So what did this tell you?
Student: The point where the two lines intersect is the number of hours where she makes $80$. So it is $(x, 80)$. The value of $x$ is somewhere between 6 and 7 hours, but closer to 7.
Teacher: So how can you figure it out more precisely?
Student: I am not sure.
Teacher: If you look at the three points that are given, how are hours worked related to the amount earned?
Student: The hours worked times 12 gives you the amount she earned.
Teacher: So can this help you figure out how to find the $x$-coordinate of your point of intersection?
Student: I can set up an equation $x \times 12 = 80$ and solve for $x$.
Teacher: That sounds like a good plan. I will check back in with you later.
A student makes the table shown below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hours</th>
<th>Earnings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Teacher: Tell me how you got the numbers in your table?
Student: I read the points in the graph.
Teacher: Does that help you answer the question?
Student: Not really. She had to work more than four hours but less than eight. I am not sure where to go from here.
Teacher: I am wondering if you could expand your table to include other values that were not on the graph. How could you get started?
Student: I could put in hours 1 through 9 and then see if I could figure out how much she would make for that number.
Teacher: Okay. So how will you figure out how much she earns for any number of hours?
Student: Well, if I look at the three values in the table, it seems that each of the hours was multiplied by 12 to get the earnings. So that means she must make $12 an hour. So, I will just multiply all the hours in my new table by 12 and see if I can find what number of hours get her more than $80.
Teacher: Sounds good!
A student cannot get started.

Teacher: What have you figured out so far?
Student: Nothing. I am not sure what to do.
Teacher: The first thing you need to do is to figure out how much money she makes every hour. Do you remember what operation you need to use to do that?
Student: Divide?
Teacher: What are you going to divide?
Student: 2 ÷ 24?
Teacher: No, 24 ÷ 2.
Student: So, it’s 12.
Teacher: So this is the amount she makes per hour. Now you need to divide 80 by 12.
A student can’t get started.

Teacher: What have you figured out so far?
Student: Nothing. I am not sure what to do.
Teacher: Why don’t you start by reading the problem again and then looking really closely at the graph. I will be back in a few minutes.
RESEARCH FINDINGS

Five Types of Teacher Responses to Struggle:

1. Telling
   - More likely to lower the demands of the task and remove struggle

2. Directed Guidance
   - More likely to maintain the demands of the task and support productive struggle

3. Probing Guidance
4. Affordance

5. Unfocused or Vague

SO WHAT DOES IT TAKE?
EFFECTIVE MATHEMATICS TEACHING PRACTICES

1. Establish mathematics goals to focus learning.
2. Implement tasks that promote reasoning and problem solving.
3. Use and connect mathematical representations.
4. Facilitate meaningful mathematical discourse.
5. Pose purposeful questions.
6. Build procedural fluency from conceptual understanding.
7. Support productive struggle in learning mathematics.
8. Elicit and use evidence of student thinking.
EFFECTIVE MATHEMATICS TEACHING PRACTICES

1. Establish mathematics goals to focus learning.
2. Implement tasks that promote reasoning and problem solving.
3. Use and connect mathematical representations.
4. Facilitate meaningful mathematical discourse.
5. Pose purposeful questions.
6. Build procedural fluency from conceptual understanding.
7. **Support productive struggle in learning mathematics.**
8. Elicit and use evidence of student thinking.
Establish math goals to focus learning

Implement tasks that promote reasoning and problem solving

Build procedural fluency from conceptual understanding

Facilitate meaningful mathematical discourse

Pose purposeful questions

Use and connect mathematical representations

Elicit and use evidence of student thinking

Support productive struggle in learning mathematics
Effective Mathematics Teaching Practices
“Building a Teaching Framework”

Establish math goals to focus learning

Implement tasks that promote reasoning and problem solving
Build procedural fluency from conceptual understanding

Facilitate meaningful mathematical discourse

Pose purposeful questions
Elicit and use evidence of student thinking

Use and connect mathematical representations
Support productive struggle in learning mathematics
Effective Mathematics Teaching Practices
“Building a Teaching Framework”

Establish math goals to focus learning

Implement tasks that promote reasoning and problem solving
Build procedural fluency from conceptual understanding

Facilitate meaningful mathematical discourse

Pose purposeful questions
Use and connect mathematical representations
Support productive struggle in learning mathematics

Elicit and use evidence of student thinking
ACTIVITY 2

WHAT ARE THE CHARACTERISTICS OF A TEACHER'S INTERACTIONS THAT SUPPORT PRODUCTIVE STRUGGLE?
The deep sea is the lowest level of the ocean floor. Sunlight does not reach the deep sea, and scientists are discovering that it is home to amazing creatures that live in total darkness. Deep-sea creatures live more than 1000 feet below the water’s surface. Marine biologists in an underwater vessel are descending to study a new species of fish that was discovered in the deep sea. Their vessel is currently located 100 feet below the surface (-100 feet). From this location, the biologists start their timer at \( t = 0 \) and begin their descent. They descend at a rate of 25 feet per minute. The vessel continues descending at this constant rate until it has reached a depth where they can study the deep sea creatures.

1. After how many minutes will the vessel be positioned to observe deep-sea creatures? Explain how you know.
2. Write an inequality to represent the depth of the vessel at any point in time, \( t \), after the vessel has reached a depth at which the marine biologists can observe deep sea creatures, where \( t \) represents the number of minutes since the vessel has left its original position of -100 feet.

Adapted from Seventh Grade Set of Related Lessons: Investigating Inequalities, Institute for Learning, University of Pittsburgh, 2015.
Ms. Kaufmann’s seventh-grade class is working on the Deep Dark Secret task, which presents students with a situation that they have not yet encountered in their work in the unit—a negative rate of change.

In the dialogue, Ms. Kaufmann is interacting with a group of students (Kaila, Jake, Jerome, and Chris), who have arrived at an incorrect solution to the first part of the Deep Dark Secret task.

What did the teacher do to support the group’s productive struggle?
WHAT DID MS. KAUFMANN DO?

She supported productive struggle by--

• selecting a task that had the potential to engage students in reasoning and problem solving
• asking questions to determine what her students understood and to advance them beyond where they currently were
• connecting representations – the problem context and the drawing of the situation represented
• eliciting and using evidence of student thinking to advance their understanding of the situation
• facilitating meaning discourse within the small group
STRATEGIES FOR SUPPORTING PRODUCTIVE STRUGGLE

- Question
- Encourage
- Give Time
- Acknowledge

“Teachers ask questions that help students focus on their thinking and identify the source of their struggle, then encourage students to build on their thinking or look at other ways to approach the problem.”

Ms. Kaufmann asked questions that made the students’ thinking public (lines 1–9). The answers to this series of questions made clear to the teacher the source of the students’ error.

“Teachers encourage students to reflect on their work and support student struggle in their effort and not just in getting the correct answers.”

Ms. Kaufmann asked students to draw and explain a picture that represented the situations (lines 10–11; 19) and to reread the problem aloud (lines 23-24). This series of interactions encouraged students to reflect on and reconsider what they had done and ultimately to revise their drawing (line 33) and their solution (lines 43-52).

"Teachers give time and support for students to manage their struggles through adversity and failure by not stepping in too soon or too much, thereby taking the intellectual work away from the students."

Ms. Kaufmann also gave the group time to work to create the picture (lines 12-13) without hovering over them, sending the clear message that she had confidence that they could do the work without her assistance.

“Teachers acknowledge that struggle is an important part of learning and doing mathematics.”

In the end, Ms. Kaufmann acknowledged the group’s effort and the students’ ability to work through the problem (lines 55-57).

TAKE AWAY

• Productive struggle is central to student learning.
• Students need something with which to struggle – the task matters!
• All students know something relevant whether they recognize it or not.
• Teachers need to find ways to support students learning without taking over the thinking for them. The four strategies (question, encourage, time, acknowledge) and the eight effective teaching practices can help.

• Advance planning is key.
MORE ABOUT THE EFFECTIVE TEACHING PRACTICES


If there is no struggle, there is no progress.

Frederick Douglass
Thank you
1. Ms. K: So how long do you think it will take before they will see the creatures? Kaila?
2. Kaila: We think it would take 40 minutes.
3. Ms. K: It will take 40 minutes to do what? Jake?
4. Jake: To get to the deep sea.
6. Chris: We divided 1000 by 25.
8. Jerome: It says that deep-sea creatures live more than 1000 feet below the surface. So if the vessel goes down 25 feet per minute, you just divide 1000 by 25.
9. Ms. K: Can you draw a picture of the situation to help explain what you did? I will be back in a few minutes to see what you came up with.
10. [Teacher leaves to respond to other students and returns five minutes later. Members of the group work discuss what the picture should look like. Kaila offers to draw.]
11. Ms. K: So, tell me about your picture.
12. Kaila: Okay, see [referring to the drawing below], we started with the surface of the ocean and then showed where the deep sea started, which is 1000 feet below the surface.
19. Ms. K: So, how does this picture explain what you did? Jerome?
20. Jerome: The vessel kept going down 25 feet every minute. So, you need to find out how many 25's it takes to get to 1000. That will tell you how many minutes it would take to get to 1000. So, it takes 40 minutes, just like Kaila said.
21. Ms. K: Okay. So, what else do we know about the situation? Jake, can you reread the problem?
22. [Jake reads the problem aloud and stops when he reaches the part that says “The vessels starts 100 feet below the surface.”]
23. Chris: Oh wait…our drawing isn’t right…the vessel starts 100 feet below the surface. We need to fix our picture.
24. Ms. K: Does everyone see what Chris is saying?
25. Jake: Yeah. The vessel was already 100 feet below the surface when they decided to go see the sea creatures.
26. Jerome: Okay, so that means that they only went down 900 feet, not 1000.
27. Kaila: [Quickly making a change, as in the sketch shown below.] Now this shows what Jerome just said.
38. Ms. K: So does the starting point make a difference? Chris?
39. Chris: Yeah, because like Jerome said, they only went down 900 feet from where they started, not 1000 feet.
40. Ms. K: So, what does the drawing suggest to you about your initial approach to the problem?
41. Jake: So, it should be 900 divided by 25. [Jerome quickly divides 900 by 25].
42. Jerome: Which is 36.
43. Ms. K: Okay, so what does 36 mean in this problem? Kaila?
44. Kaila: It is the number of minutes it took to get to deep sea.
45. Ms. K: Does everyone agree?
46. Chris: I think it takes 36 to get to 1000 feet but you need to get deeper than that to actually see sea creatures because the creatures are more than 1000 feet below the surface.
47. Ms. K: So how long will that take?
49. Ms. K: Does everyone agree?
50. Students: Yeah!
51. Ms. K: I liked the way you all worked together on this. I knew you could figure it out! Now you are ready to take on the second part of the task. I will check in with you a little later.